The 'Pentecostal' Beginnings and Ecumenical Horizon of Early English Baptists

Christopher L. Schelin

Revd Dr Christopher L. Schelin is the Dean of Students at Starr King School for the Ministry in Oakland, California, and a Senior Research Fellow at IBTS Centre, Amsterdam.
cschelin@sksm.edu
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6021-6338

Abstract
As their collective identity coalesced through the seventeenth century, early English Baptists grounded their vision of a reformed church not only on right understanding of Scripture but also faithful dependence on the Holy Spirit. Consequently, they experimented with and contested a range of practices that would be recognised as 'Pentecostal' in the present day. These practices included the laying on of hands for receiving the Holy Spirit, direct inspiration of the elements of worship such as songs of praise, and divine healing of illness. These characteristics express points of ecumenical convergence with the later Pentecostal and charismatic movements that belie bounded theological demarcations. This article[1] rehearses those initial Baptist convictions about being a Spirit-empowered people, identifies the parallels with Pentecostalism, and argues that a retrieval of this history should lay the groundwork for as-yet unrealised ecumenical dialogue.

Keywords
Baptists; Pentecostalism; charismatic Christianity; ecumenism

Introduction

Two hundred and fifty years before Pentecostalism emerged out of revival meetings across the world, the English Baptist prophetess Katherine Sutton embodied a spirituality redolent of later charismatic emphases. Like so many other devout Puritans and Separatists of the era, Sutton long travailed in angst over the weight of her sins and sought assurance of election. During this season, she not only searched through Scripture for divine direction, but also gleaned insight from 'dreames

[1] A version of the material in this article was presented in a paper to the Annual Meeting of the Association of Baptist Professors of Religion, Belmont University, Nashville, Tennesse, 23–25 May 2022.

and visions of the night'.[2] She became convinced that the established church was in error and united herself with a Baptist community. Sutton recounts that, during one of her many occasions of illness, she requested intercession from her pastor and church, with the result that she was healed while they prayed.[3] Sometime afterward, she submitted to believer's baptism.

As she meditated on the promises of God's generosity in Matthew 7:7,11 and of inspired prophecy in Acts 2:18 and Joel 2:28, Sutton began praying for further empowerment by the Holy Spirit. She reports that her plea was dramatically fulfilled as she was out on a walk one day. She received a 'gift of singing' in which words and melody would come upon her in a moment.[4] Some of these songs were understood as prophetic oracles, including calls for national repentance and predictions of future events. Sutton embarked upon a public ministry for several years, culminating in the publication of her autobiography, *A Christian womans experience*, in 1663. The narrative is pneumatologically rich as it testifies to a life of continual trust in and dependence upon the Holy Spirit.

Sutton's model of faithful living is rapidly becoming normative for increasing numbers of believers. In February 2020, the Center for the Study of Global Christianity at Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary, in collaboration with Oral Roberts University, announced the completion of a demographic analysis concerning the worldwide growth of Pentecostal and charismatic Christian faith. The authors proposed a new umbrella term, 'Spirit-empowered Christianity', to summarise the shared vision that unites renewalist Roman Catholics with house-church apostles. Across its many permutations, Spirit-empowered Christianity has been a global evangelistic success story for twelve decades and counting. An estimated one quarter of all Christians may be classified as

[2] Reprinted in Curtis W. Freeman, *A Company of Women Preachers: Baptist Prophetesses in Seventeenth-Century England* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2011), p. 598.
[3] Freeman, *A Company of Women Preachers,* p. 606.
[4] Freeman, *A Company of Women Preachers,* p. 608.

'Spirit empowered' and the report predicts that the percentage will rise to one-third by 2050.[5]

The history of Baptist engagement with Spirit-empowered movements is characterised by a complex ambivalence. In his voluminous survey, *Baptists and the Holy Spirit*, C. Douglas Weaver narrates how Baptists in the United States have responded to these forms of Christianity with varying degrees of opposition, wariness, and the occasional warm embrace.[6] European Baptist interactions with Spirit-empowered Christianity have been comparable.[7] While both sides of the conversation have frequently asserted sharp demarcations, the relationship between Baptists and Pentecostals or Charismatics has long included expressions of hybridity. For contemporary examples of convergent identity, one may list the Evangelical Free Church in Sweden,[8] the Nigerian Baptist Convention's endorsement of the

---

[5] 'Spirit-Empowered Christianity is one of the fastest growing global movements, new study shows', Religion News Service, 25 February 2020: <https://religionnews.com/2020/02/25/spirit-empowered-christianity-is-one-of-the-fastest-growing-global-movements-new-study-shows/> [accessed 23 March 2022].
For the full text of the study, see Todd M. Johnson and Gina A. Zurlo, *Introducing Spirit-Empowered Christianity: The Global Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements in the 21st Century* (Tulsa, OK: ORU Press, forthcoming).

[6] C. Douglas Weaver, *Baptists and the Holy Spirit: The Contested History with Holiness-Pentecostal-Charismatic Movements* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2019), p. xii.

[7] For the spectrum of European Baptist responses to Spirit-empowered movements, see Nigel G. Wright, 'Charismatics', in *A Dictionary of European Baptist Life and Thought,* ed by John H. Y. Briggs, Studies in Baptist History and Thought, 22 (Milton Keynes: Paternoster, 2009), pp. 78–79; John H. Y. Briggs, 'Pentecostalism, Baptists and', in *A Dictionary of European Baptist Life and Thought*, ed. by Briggs, pp. 386–387; Anneli Lohikko, 'August Jauhiainen and the Pentecostal Dilemma in the Finnish Baptist Union (1930–1953)', in *Counter-Cultural Communities: Baptistic Life in Twentieth-Century Europe*, ed. by Keith G. Jones and Ian M. Randall, Studies in Baptist History and Thought, 32 (Milton Keynes: Paternoster, 2008), pp. 115–172; Douglas McBain, 'Mainstream Charismatics: Some Observations of Baptist Renewal', in *Charismatic Christianity: Sociological Perspectives*, ed. by Stephen Hunt, Malcolm Hamilton, and Tony Walter (Houndmills, UK: Macmillan Press, 1997), pp. 43–59; Nigel Wright, 'The Influence of the Charismatic Movement on European Baptist Life and Mission: Theological Reflections', *EPTA Bulletin,* 13, no. 1 (1994), 5–18 (note that EPTA Bulletin is currently known as and found under The Journal of Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity).

[8] For a history of 'Spirit-empowered' Christianity in Sweden, see Jan-Åke Alvarsson, 'Pentecostalism in Sweden and Finland', in *Global Renewal Christianity: Spirit-Empowered Movements Past, Present, and Future*, *Volume 4: Europe and North America,* ed. by Vinson Synan and Amos Yong (Lake Mary, FL: Charisma House, 2017), pp. 179–197. The Evangelical Free Church asserts its combined Baptist and charismatic identity on a glossary page of its website, 'Ordlista för EFK',

continuity of miraculous gifts in its Statement of Faith,[9] and 'Bapticostal' expressions among African-American believers, such as the Full Gospel Baptist Church Fellowship International.[10]

Weaver's survey briefly acknowledges historical anecdotes that further crumble the Baptist-Pentecostal dividing wall; specifically, he names the ecstatic eruptions in revival services conducted by Separate Baptists in eighteenth-century America as well as accounts of faith healing in seventeenth-century England.[11] Katherine Sutton's account invites further inquiry into the possibilities for ecumenical comparison, because she so remarkably epitomises Pentecostal spirituality from a post-conversion enduement of the Spirit, to the expectancy and reception of divine healing, to the manifestation of seemingly extraordinary gifts and graces. My purpose here is to synthesise prior research and offer new summations of source material to document how these prominent themes in Sutton's discourse recurred among Baptists in seventeenth-century England. Sutton was a distinctive voice but not entirely idiosyncratic, for many of the first Baptists both taught and embodied the conviction that the Holy Spirit must be actively sought to enable multiple dimensions of Christian discipleship. This conviction animated the controversies regarding the laying on of hands and the singing of hymns in worship and modulated their nearly uniform commitment to the cessation of the so-called 'extraordinary' spiritual gifts at the close of the apostolic age. This data will allow me to elucidate parallels with Spirit-empowered Christianity, drawing specifically from 'classical' Pentecostal sources,[12] to reveal that the first generations of Baptists bore a greater resemblance to this form of the faith than would be suggested by their spiritual descendants. I will conclude with a proposal that this tentative set of convergences may catalyse formal

---

Evangeliska Frikyrkan <https://www.efk.se/intro/ordlista-for-efk.html> [accessed 23 March 2022].

[9] Nigerian Baptist Convention Statement of Faith <https://www.nigerianbaptist.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/NBC-Statement-of-Faith.pdf> [accessed 23 March 2022].

[10] Full Gospel Baptist Fellowship International <https://www.fullgospelbaptist.org/> [accessed 23 March 2022].

[11] Weaver, *Baptists and the Holy Spirit*, pp. xv, 31.

[12] For a definition of classical Pentecostalism, see Wolfgang Vondey, *Beyond Pentecostalism: The Crisis of Global Christianity and the Renewal of a Theological Agenda*, Pentecostal Manifestos (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2010), pp. 11–12.

ecumenical dialogue between Baptists and Pentecostals equivalent to those undertaken by the Baptist World Alliance and other international bodies representative of distinct Christian traditions.[13]

Recognisably charismatic behaviours and practices did not arise *sui generis* among English Baptists. As historian Geoffrey Nuttall demonstrated, early Baptist focus on the Holy Spirit was framed by a broader pneumatological resurgence conceived within Puritan theological reflection. From his vantage point in the mid-twentieth century, Nuttall boldly claimed that the doctrine of the Spirit 'received a more thorough and detailed consideration […] than it has at any other time in Christian history'.[14] While such a claim is surely dated in the wake of the global charismatic renewal, Nuttall elaborates a Puritan emphasis on direct experience, as well as debates regarding personal revelation and an eschatological outpouring of the Spirit, that parallel later Pentecostal and charismatic convictions.[15]

Comparison between Pentecostalism and the first Baptists is naturally complicated by the dynamic pressures placed upon the latter. Early English Baptists were engaged in multiple processes of collective identity formation during a turbulent era of political, cultural, and religious upheaval.[16] They aimed to restore and build authentic Christianity in defiance of the claimed apostasy of Rome and Canterbury, but also in rejection of the more radical proposals of the Quakers and Seekers. Their self-understanding as the 'baptised churches' was thus fiercely and continuously debated. While tendencies and broadly-accepted notions may be identified, I do not claim a generic consensus regarding the convictions that will be described. The early Baptists were not mere rational biblicists who read and applied the dictates of the text, but neither can they be neatly scripted into grand

[13] The records of bilateral dialogues can be found at the website of the Baptist World Alliance <https://baptistworld.org/dialogues/> [accessed 23 March 2022].
[14] Geoffrey Nuttall, *The Holy Spirit in Puritan Faith and Experience*, 2nd edn (Oxford: Blackwell, 1947), p. viii.
[15] Nuttall, *The Holy Spirit*, e.g. pp. 7, 28, 49–56, 102–108, 135 and following.
[16] Cf. Matthew C. Bingham, *Orthodox Radicals: Baptist Identity in the English Revolution,* Oxford Studies in Historical Theology (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019).

narratives of perennial charismatic currents flowing through church history.[17]

Empowered by the Spirit

One significant controversy that highlights early Baptist concern for the Spirit-filled life was the debate over the laying on of hands upon converts after baptism. The history of this debate has been covered elsewhere and can be briefly summarised. Beginning in the 1640s, some Baptists became convinced that Christ had established the imposition of hands as a fundamental ordinance of the church. A central text in support of this belief was Hebrews 6:1–2, which names the practice as one of the elementary doctrines of the Christian faith. The majority of General Baptists came to accept the teaching, which was endorsed by their General Assembly and incorporated into three confessions of faith. Laying on of hands received some support among Particular Baptists but never became widespread in their ranks. The controversy resulted in a significant number of pamphlets that were published both in defence of and opposition to the rite, with the two active periods occurring in 1653–1655 and 1669–1675.[18]

As was the case with credobaptism, proponents' efforts centred on establishing the biblical credentials of the imposition of hands rather than elaborating a theological interpretation. Nevertheless, as Ernest Payne noted, advocacy was not restricted merely to biblicist warrants, as if the rite was to be performed simply out of obedience to the textual command. Practitioners understood the Holy Spirit to be intimately related to the laying on of hands and in some way conveyed to the

[17] Early Baptists are thus absent from works such as *Christian Peoples of the Spirit: A Documentary History of Pentecostal Spirituality from the Early Church to the Present*, ed. by Stanley M. Burgess (New York: New York University Press, 2011); and Eddie L. Hyatt, *2000 Years of Charismatic Christianity* (Lake Mary, FL: Charisma House, 2002).

[18] See Ernest A. Payne, 'Baptists and the Laying on of Hands', *Baptist Quarterly*, 15, no. 5 (1954), 203–215; Clint C. Bass, *Thomas Grantham (1633–1692) and General Baptist Theology*, Centre for Baptist Studies in Oxford Publications 10 (Oxford: Regent's Park College, 2019), pp. 103–116, 134–136; Joseph C. Delahunt, 'The "Laying on of Hands" Controversy: Convictional Analysis of Performative Practice', in *Baptist Sacramentalism 3*, ed. by Anthony R. Cross and Philip E. Thompson (Eugene, OR: Pickwick Publications, 2020), pp. 194–197.

believer because of it.[19] Clint Bass has identified how certain proponents struggled to define the significance of the rite with greater precision and as a result opponents accused them of inconsistency.[20] Some simply described it vaguely as an increase of the Spirit's presence[21] whereas others, such as John Griffith, implied or claimed that the initial indwelling of the Spirit occurred through the rite.[22]

My own review of Baptist writings advocating the imposition of hands reveals three notable tendencies. First of all, a consistent theology *does* appear among the plurality of authors and is represented by those who specify the meaning of the rite. Out of the fourteen figures surveyed, five state the purpose of the ordinance as the reception of the gifts and fruits of the Spirit delineated by the Apostle Paul.[23] In his plea to fellow Baptists to adopt the ordinance, John More declared that they should 'expect that some useful gift or gifts should be given you to profit withal' and specifically named the gifts of knowledge, faith, and prophecy as having been bestowed upon recent recipients.[24] The

---

19 Payne, 'Baptists and the Laying on of Hands', p. 214.
20 Bass, *Thomas Grantham*, pp. 110, 123–124.
21 For example, Christopher Blackwood, *A Soul-searching Catechism*, 2nd edn (London: Printed by J.C. for Giles Calvert, 1653), p. 56, available at Early English Books Online: <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/e/eebo2/A28310.0001.001?view=toc> [accessed 17 June 2022]; Benjamin Keach, *Laying on of hands upon baptized believers* (London: Benjamin Harris, 1698), p. 77, available at Early English Books Online <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/e/eebo/A47585.0001.001?view=toc> [accessed 17 June 2022].
22 Bass, *Thomas Grantham*, pp. 109, 123.
23 John More, *A lost ordinance restored* (London: Richard Moone, 1653), pp. 4, 7, available at Early English Books Online: <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/e/eebo/A89283.0001.001> [accessed 17 June 2022]; Thomas Tillam, *The fourth Principle of Christian religion* (London: Printed by E.C. for Henry Eversden; 1655), pp. 19, 31–37, 41, 52, available at Early English Books Online: <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo2;idno=A94351.0001.001> [accessed 17 June 2022]; William Rider, *Laying on of Hands asserted* (London: R. Moon, 1656), pp. 63, 72f., 88f., 152, available at Early English Books Online: <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo;idno=A57271.0001.001> [accessed 17 June 2022]; Thomas Grantham, *Christianismus primitivus* (London: Francis Smith, 1678), Book 2, Section 2, pp. 32, 41f., available at Early English Books Online: <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo2;idno=A41775.0001.001> [accessed 17 June 2022]; Samuel Fisher, *Baby-baptism meer babism* (London: Henry Hills, 1653), pp. 501–504, available at Early English Books Online: <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo;idno=A39573.0001.001> [accessed 17 June 2022].
24 More, *A lost ordinance restored*, p. 7.

General Baptist leader Thomas Grantham, a prolific and articulate advocate of the doctrine, distinguished the work of the Spirit as bringing about conversion from the subsequent indwelling of the Spirit via the gifts and fruits, in which the Spirit becomes a 'seal and confirmation of the Souls of Christians'.[25]

Second, the implied sacramentality of grace conveyed through a visible sign was made explicit by several advocates. For the Particular Baptist leader Benjamin Keach, laying on of hands had equal status with baptism, being one of the 'two Doors to be passed through' during Christian initiation.[26] Remonstrating against the Quakers, Keach referred to all ordinances as 'conduit-pipes for conveyance of the Spirit' and that each ordinance had a particular blessing attached to it.[27] Christopher Blackwood similarly describes the imposition of hands as the *vehiculum spiritus*.[28] Grantham also viewed laying on of hands as sacramentally efficacious.[29] Such sacramentalism was not a restriction on divine grace. Both Keach and Thomas Tillam, for example, insisted that God was free to act outside of the rite even as they summoned believers to the ordained means of empowerment for moral living and mutual ministry.[30]

Finally, proponents appealed to direct experience as confirmation of the rite's centrality and efficacy. While largely denying that laying on of hands would be accompanied in the present day by the miraculous occurrences depicted in the New Testament, Baptists perceived themselves changed by it. William Pryer testifies to weakened devotion and increased susceptibility to temptation when he opposed

---

[25] Grantham, *Christianismus primitivus*, Book 2, Section 2, pp. 32–33.

[26] Keach, *Laying on of hands upon baptized believers*, pp. 2, 89.

[27] Keach, *Laying on of hands upon baptized believers*, preface, p. 98. Keach was likely influenced by Tillam, who previously referred to the laying on of hands as the vehicle or conduit pipe for conveying the Spirit's gifts: Tillam, *The fourth principle of Christian religion*, p. 19.

[28] Blackwood, *A Soul-searching Catechism*, p. 57.

[29] Bass, *Thomas Grantham*, p. 126.

[30] Tillam, *The fourth principle of Christian religion*, pp. 26, 33; Keach, *Laying on of hands upon baptized believers*, p. 78. Cf. contemporary British Baptist theologian John Colwell for the ecumenical understanding of a sacrament as 'a sign through and in which God freely accomplishes that which is signified, not in a manner that can be presumed upon or manipulated, but in a manner that is truly gracious' (Colwell, *Promise and Presence: An Exploration of Sacramental Theology* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2011), p. 11).

the laying on of hands, but upon being convinced and submitting to it, he found that, for himself and others, the result was an increase of religious zeal and love for others.[31] Tillam, an erstwhile cessationist, offers a cryptic testimony of witnessing invisible yet powerful 'operations of the Spirit' during the performance of the rite. To those who did not experience an immediate effect he counselled a patient faith, waiting upon the Spirit to manifest more fully.[32]

Worship in the Spirit

A second dimension of early Baptist life that demonstrates a keenly felt dependence upon the Spirit was their common understanding that authentic worship must be directly, even quite specifically, inspired. While Baptist theology of worship is noted for emphasising the Christocentric theme of the risen Lord's presence 'where two or three are gathered' (Matt 18:20),[33] the first generations of Baptists repeatedly quoted or alluded to Jesus's declaration in John 4:23 that true worship will be conducted 'in spirit and in truth'. This text appears twice in Sutton's autobiography, or three times if one counts the citation in the foreword written by her friend and supporter Hanserd Knollys.[34] He alludes to or cites the verse multiple times in his own corpus[35] and it also appears in the works of, among others, John Murton, John Tombes, and

---

31 William Pryer, *The poor mans progresse and rest* (1655), pp. 11–12, available at Oxford Text Archive: <https://ota.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/repository/xmlui/bitstream/handle/20.500.12024/A56233a/A56233.html/> [accessed 23 June 2022].

32 Tillam, *The fourth principle of Christian religion*, pp. 36, 59.

33 Cf. Christopher J. Ellis, *Gathering: A Theology and Spirituality of Worship in Free Church Tradition* (London: SCM Press, 2004), pp. 93, 230; Rodney Wallace Kennedy and Derek C. Hatch, 'Introduction', in *Gathering Together: Baptists at Work and Worship* by Kennedy and Hatch (Eugene, OR: Pickwick Publications, 2013), p. x.

34 Freeman, *A Company of Women Preachers*, pp. 595, 602, 621.

35 For example, Hanserd Knollys, *The parable of the Kingdom of heaven expounded* (London: Printed for Benjamin Harris, 1674), p. 15, available at Early English Books Online <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo2;idno=A47568.0001.001> [accessed 17 June 2022]. On the frequency of Knollys' references, see Dennis C. Bustin, *Paradox and Perseverance: Hanserd Knollys, Particular Baptist Pioneer in Seveneth-Century England,* Studies in Baptist History and Thought, 23 (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2006), pp. 290–291.

Isaac Marlow.[36] This theological theme developed as part of the critique of the 'set forms' of Catholic and Anglican liturgy.[37] Ensconced in the Reformed tradition with its understanding of worship defined by the 'regulative principle', Baptist rebukes of prescribed liturgy were characteristically rooted in its lack of explicit Scriptural mandate. But yet again, as with the laying on of hands, early English Baptists did not limit their arguments to biblicist parameters, with prescribed liturgy coming under rebuke for quenching the Spirit.[38] As Keach wrote, while true worship required the Word — that is, practice according to the true order and ordinances of Christ — it would be conducted in vain without the Spirit's aid.[39]

The necessity of Spirit inspiration was a central conviction for both proponents and detractors of singing in worship. Initially, Baptists largely rejected congregational singing as a 'carnal' form of the old covenant that had been abrogated by Christ's death and resurrection. New Testament passages that appeared to recount singing either referred to an internal 'spiritual' experience or to the Spirit's

---

[36] John Murton, *A most humble supplication of many the kings Maiesties loyall subjects* (n.p., 1621), p. 33, available at Early English Books Online: <http://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo2;idno=B07159.0001.001> [accessed 17 June 2022]; John Tombes, *Iehovah iireh: or, God's providence in delivering the godly* (London: Printed by Richard Cotes, for Michael Sparkes Sr., 1643), p. 5, available at Early English Books Online: <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo;idno=A94736.0001.001> [accessed 17 June 2022]; Isaac Marlow, *Prelimited forms of praising God, vocally sung by all the church together, proved to be no gospel ordinance* (London, 1691), p. 43, available at Early English Books Online: <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo2;idno=B04474.0001.001> [accessed 17 June 2022]. Of course, this attention to John 4:23 was not peculiar to Baptists but was expressed within the broader Puritan-Separatist movement. See Matthew Ward, *Pure Worship: The Early English Baptist Distinctive*, Monographs in Baptist History, 3 (Eugene, OR: Pickwick, 2014), pp. 84–85.

[37] Ward, *Pure Worship*, pp. 82–84.

[38] For example, Vavasor Powell, *Common-prayer-book no divine service* (London: Printed for Livewell Chapman, 1661), p. 4, available at Early English Books Online: <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo2;idno=A55574.0001.001> [accessed 20 June 2022]. Powell was Welsh but ministered among Baptists in England.

[39] Benjamin Keach, *The breach repaired in God's worship* (London, 1691), p. 170, available at Early English Books Online: <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo;idno=A47407.0001.001> [accessed 20 June 2022].

extraordinary inspiration of individuals during the apostolic age.[40] Some communities, in line with fellow Puritans, made allowance for the metrical singing of Psalms as an ordained practice. But many, following John Smyth's convictions about spiritual worship, understood the use of any prescribed text as an interference with the obligation to rely on immediate inspiration in the exercise of ordinances such as preaching and prayer.

Matthew Stanton has identified two stages in the Baptist adoption of singing.[41] The latter stage occurred as the infamous 'Hymn-Singing Controversy' in the last decade of the century, when Benjamin Keach spearheaded the widespread adoption of communal singing of pre-composed hymns. But the first stage generated a unique Baptist innovation in which individuals like Sutton claimed in-the-moment reception of a song and could express it as the solo exercise of a gift in worship. These claims understood musical inspiration not to have ceased at the close of the New Testament period; rather, it was a present reality that Baptists witnessed and manifested. In his foreword to *A Christian womans experience*, Knollys affirmed that Sutton had received a definite spiritual gift, such that the person so filled 'break[s] forth into singing'. Furthermore, Knollys claimed his own experiences of such ecstasy and voiced his wish that the prophecy of Joel 2 be fulfilled, such that the 'sons and daughters of Zion' may receive an anointing of the Spirit and praise God with new song.[42] Edward Drapes likewise argued in *Gospel-Glory proclaimed before the sonnes of men* that 'true praising of God from the power of the Spirit' is one of the ordinances of the church, wherein an individual receives a special gift for the edification of the whole.[43]

---

[40] James M. Renihan, *Edification and Beauty: The Practical Ecclesiology of the English Particular Baptists, 1675–1705*, Studies in Baptist History and Thought, 17 (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock, 2009), pp. 146–152.

[41] The following is taken from Matthew Stanton, *Liturgy and Identity: London Baptists and the Hymn-Singing Controversy* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2022).

[42] Freeman, *A Company of Women Preachers*, pp. 594–596.

[43] Edward Drapes, *Gospel-Glory proclaimed before the sonnes of men* (London: Printed for Francis Tyton, 1649), pp. 162f., available at Early English Books Online <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo2;idno=A81727.0001.001> [accessed 20 June 2022].

When Keach implored Particular Baptists to accept collective singing of pre-written hymns, his arguments were both textually derived and pneumatologically focused. As Stanton notes, Keach shifted the definition of an inspired song, according the Spirit a necessary role in the composition of a work. In his first major defence of congregational singing, *A Breach repaired in God's worship*, he presented the writing of sermons and hymns as comparable; in both cases, an inspired composition fulfils the 'Spirit and truth' paradigm of worship if it is written in accordance with Scripture and by the aid of the Third Person.[44] Knollys, having been convinced of the appropriateness of group singing by Keach, likewise paralleled the ordinances of song and prayer, declaring both 'are to be performed by the anointing of the Spirit'.[45] Ultimately, Keach made inspiration a general principle for all rites: 'There is no Duty nor Ordinance of the Gospel, that can be performed acceptably to God without the Spirit, or the gracious influences thereof.'[46] While inspiration was now understood in a synergistic mode rather than as divine dictation, Particular Baptists at the end of the century still conceived of authentic worship as a Spirit-led endeavour.

Signs of the Spirit

The first Baptists inherited a doctrine of the cessation of extraordinary spiritual gifts that had been explicated by John Calvin.[47] Yet this general cessationism was complexified by the early Baptists' experiences that signified the manifest presence of the Spirit. The testimonies of Knollys and Sutton regarding a special inspiration for song mitigated against a complete break with the apostolic era, as did other claims regarding

---

[44] Keach, *The breach repaired in God's worship*, p. 136.

[45] Knollys, *An exposition of the whole book of Revelation* (London, 1689), p. 76, available at Internet Archive <https://archive.org/details/expositionrevela00knoluoft/mode/2up> [accessed 20 June 2022].

[46] Keach, *The breach repaired in God's worship*, p. 170.

[47] Cf. John Mark Ruthven, *On the Cessation of the Charismata: The Protestant Polemic on Post-Biblical Miracles*, rev. and expanded edn, Word and Spirit Monograph Series, 1 (Tulsa, OK: Word and Spirit Press, 2011), p. 22–23; Shaw, *Miracles in Enlightenment England*, pp. 22–23.

prophetic inspiration.[48] But the most significant exception to cessationist doctrine was the belief in and practice of divine healing, which was especially prevalent among Particular Baptists. Historian Jane Shaw devotes an entire chapter of her book *Miracles in Enlightenment England* to the Particulars, wherein she relates that the ordinance of healing was accepted from the middle of the seventeenth through the early eighteenth century.[49] It arose in the political context of the Civil War and Commonwealth as England was troubled by violence and instability. Baptists justified healing through an appeal to the instructions in James 5 for elders to anoint the sick with oil.[50] The *ordinance* of healing was typically distinguished from the *spiritual gift* of healing. Whereas the latter was an extraordinary practice reserved for the apostolic age, the former was a permanent endowment of the Spirit for the rightly-ordered church.[51]

Nevertheless, exercises of divine healing were accompanied by ecstatic behaviours similar to those described in Scripture and later Pentecostalism. Shaw retells the account of Vavasor Powell from 1646, when he was struck by a fever and felt he was dying. He sent for his ministerial colleagues in London, who came to his side and prayed for him. Powell testifies that he fell into a six-hour trance before recovering from his illness.[52] Knollys wrote about an incident when Benjamin Keach also appeared to be at death's door. Not only did Knollys pray for Keach to recover, but he felt moved to speak a word of special revelation, declaring, 'Brother Keach, I shall be in heaven before you.'

---

48 Cf. the other examples of prophetesses in Freeman, *A Company of Women Preachers*. Further discussion would also include what the Puritans and early Baptists called 'prophesying', the practising of which overlapped with preaching but included spontaneous oratory by congregants in worship. Cf. Christopher L. Schelin, 'Unbreaking the Circle: Congregational Hermeneutics and Intra-Congregational Difference', *Journal of European Baptist Studies*, 16, no. 2 (2016), 19–32; Christopher L. Schelin, *The Contestable Church: Dissent, Democracy, and Baptist Ecclesiology* (Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, forthcoming).

49 Jane Shaw, *Miracles in Enlightenment England* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), p. 33. On comparative General Baptist neglect of healing, despite the absence of opposition, see Bass, *Thomas Grantham*, pp. 126–127.

50 Shaw, *Miracles in Enlightenment England*, p. 34.

51 In this respect, Baptists disagreed with John Calvin, who held that the practice described in James 5 was no longer valid. See Shaw, *Miracles in Enlightenment England*, p. 39.

52 Shaw, *Miracles in Enlightenment England,* pp. 33–34.

Knollys passed away two years later but Keach would live for another fifteen years.[53]

Baptists did not always delimit healing as solely an outcome of the James 5 rite. Abraham Cheare related the account of Francis Langford in Cornwall, who experienced relief from his tuberculosis after being baptised. Langford had been persuaded to accept believer's baptism and then came to the conviction that he would be healed upon fulfilling his obedience. He sent for Cheare, who arrived to find him in a severely weakened and malnourished state. Langford was brought down into the water and then, upon being baptised, he strode uphill to his horse and was led home. He announced his recovery, ate a hearty meal, and slept soundly through the night. Langford did not experience an immediate and full restoration of his body but he called for his fellow believers to remain in prayer for his ongoing healing. A colleague confirmed in a letter to Cheare that Langford was improving over time.[54]

Despite the widespread practice of healing as well as other apparent exercises of dramatic spiritual power, the early English Baptists typically insisted on the distinction between the extraordinary or 'outward' and ordinary or 'inward' gifts of the Spirit, reserving the former to a special dispensation of the apostles or as accompaniments to the initial proclamation of the gospel in a new territory.[55] There are few stated exceptions to this rule, which are generally advanced with qualification. Deep into his lengthy volume *Baby-baptism meer babism*, Samuel Fisher engages Baptist critics of the laying on of hands who charge that its ongoing practice should be accompanied by the signs and gifts reported in the New Testament. Fisher contends that God granted the visible gifts so prominently in the beginning to confirm the Christian message, while the most vital graces are always granted for the benefit of believers. However, he declares that the outward gifts are only rare in

---

53 Bustin, *Paradox and Perseverance*, p. 147.

54 See 'A Letter of Abraham Cheare on Baptism, c. 1648–1658', in *Waiting on the Spirit of Promise: The Life and Theology of Suffering of Abraham Cheare,* by Brian L. Hanson and Michael A. G. Haykin, Monographs in Baptist History, 1 (Eugene, OR: Pickwick, 2014), pp. 41–46.

55 For example, Tombes, *The searchers for schism search'd*, p. 80; Thomas Morris, *A messenger sent to remove some mistakes* (London: Printed for R.E., 1655), pp. 14–16, available at Early English Books Online <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo2;idno=A89333.0001.001> [accessed 23 June 2022].

appearance, not completely abated, and specifically names healing, the discernment of spirits, and words of knowledge and wisdom as presently operative. The greatest outward gift that remains is prophecy, which may be received by those who accept prayer and the imposition of hands.[56] Tillam similarly distinguishes the external gifts, meant for the confirmation of the word and the conversion of unbelievers, from the intrinsic or 'best' gifts that empower all faithful Christians. For the former, he names healing, miracles, extraordinary prophecy, and the speaking and interpretation of diverse tongues (understood as foreign languages, not ecstatic utterance). The gift of tongues is absent because the mission field has been blocked by both the Pope and the Turks. In principle, all the gifts remain, but the extraordinary gifts are needless and unsuitable in comparison to the best gifts, enumerated by Tillam as wisdom, knowledge, faith, 'ordinary' prophecy, and the discernment of spirits.[57]

Among the theological writers whose texts remain extant, only Thomas Grantham provides an unqualified endorsement of continuationism.[58] In *Christianismus Primitivus*, Grantham asserts that the church has 'a perpetual right to […] all these spiritual gifts', naming the biblical examples without further distinction. He repudiates cessationism with the retort that God did not place the Spirit in the Body of Christ for only a few days, then to depart; rather, the Spirit must remain until God's people reach the fullness of Christ. The church is in no less need of divine assistance since the close of the New Testament period. As long as the same duties remain, the church should expect that God will supply the same gifts. Grantham bolsters these theological warrants with experiential support, claiming testimonies to the dispensation of gifts such as special prophecy and the manifestation of

---

[56] Fisher, *Baby-baptism meer babism*, pp. 502–504. Fisher defines prophecy here as 'speaking to exhortation, edification, and comfort', and thus refers to inspired preaching and teaching rather than a specified, revelatory utterance.

[57] Tillam, *The fourth principle of Christian religion*, pp. 27–32.

[58] As this article was nearing publication, I learned that Grantham's fellow General Baptist Matthew Caffyn briefly endorses the panoply of spiritual gifts as a hypothetical possibility, to be sought in earnest prayer. See *Faith in God's promises, the saint's best weapon* (London: S. Dover, 1660), p. 19. Available at Early English Books Online: <http://name.umdl.umich.edu/A78621.0001.001> [accessed 3 March 2023]. Credit to Steve Holmes for this discovery.>

miracles.[59] Grantham defends continuationism in other writings as well, including *The Fourth Principle of Christ's Doctrine Vindicated*, a tract in defence of the laying on of hands, and *A Sigh for Peace*.[60] Grantham's maximalist endorsement of spiritual empowerment is thus a consistent theme of his corpus, even as it stands as exceptional to the general theological tenor of the emerging Baptist movement.

The Ecumenical Horizon

One of the central concepts of the ecumenical movement is *convergence*, which is the reconciliation of divided Christian communions through shared, albeit not uniform, affirmations regarding doctrine and practice.[61] Convergence may be facilitated when the dialogue partners engage in 'receptive ecumenism', or the identification of the distinctive gifts that traditions offer one another as they seek the fullness of Christ.[62] But, as most famously exemplified by the landmark document *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry*, published by the World Council of Churches in 1982, convergence may also derive from a recognition that traditions are closer in their understanding of the faith than polemics had claimed.[63] Minna Hietamäki writes that when the parties in dialogue set aside previous hostilities, they discover themselves to be bearers of 'shared convictions and viewpoints' and may grow together toward

---

[59] Grantham, *Christianismus primitivus*, Book 2, Section 2, pp. 38–39.

[60] Grantham, *The fourth principle of Christs doctrine vindicated* (London, 1674), pp. 25–29, available at The Angus Library and Archive, Regent's Park College: <https://theangus.rpc.ox.ac.uk/treasures/the-fourth-principle-of-christs-doctrine-vindicated/> [accessed 23 June 2022]; Grantham, *A sigh for peace* (London, 1671), pp. 146f., available at Early English Books Online: <https://quod.lib.umich.edu/cgi/t/text/text-idx?c=eebo;idno=A41790.0001.001> [accessed 23 June 2022].

[61] Steven R. Harmon, *Ecumenism Means You, Too: Ordinary Christians and the Quest for Christian Unity* (Eugene, OR: Cascade, 2010), p. 111.

[62] Steven R. Harmon, *Baptist Identity and the Ecumenical Future: Story, Tradition, and the Recovery of Community* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2016), p. 150.

[63] World Council of Churches, *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry*, Faith and Order Paper 111 (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1982). On the surprising ecumenical consensus regarding believer's baptism, see Harmon, *Baptist Identity and the Ecumenical Future*, pp. 38–39.

consensus or, at least, an acknowledgment of plural complementarity.[64] As an offering to the further realisation of ecumenical encounter, I will highlight the parallels between the lived faith of seventeenth-century English Baptists and the later Pentecostal churches. The examination of parallels will address topics in reverse order from the historical survey.

A significant component of Pentecostalism is its emphasis on 'signs and wonders', which advocates frequently credit as playing a significant role in its explosive global expansion.[65] Pentecostal theologians Daniel Albrecht and Evan Howard write that the movement is characterised by a pervasive expectancy that the Holy Spirit will manifest in dramatic and transformative fashion.[66] Although early Baptists espoused cessationist doctrine as a rule of thumb, their practice represented an inconsistent commitment to this teaching. Some of the first English Baptists discerned the hand of God in transformative, otherwise inexplicable moments of inspiration and dramatic manifestations. Such experiences gave them permission to exclaim, in Thomas Tillam's words, that 'wonders are not totally ceased'.[67]

In the domain of what is called, perhaps quite problematically, the 'miraculous', the practice of faith healing instantiates the fullest comparison. Pentecostal healing has immediate roots in the Holiness movement of the nineteenth century.[68] The ministry of healing and claims of effectiveness have played a central role in the growth of Pentecostal and charismatic Christianity, and in some instances the majority of converts in a region will claim a healing experience as the catalyst.[69] While healing did not serve an evangelistic function for the

---

64 Minna Hietamäki, *Agreeable Agreement: An Examination of the Quest for Consensus in Ecumenical Dialogue*, Ecclesial Investigations, 8 (London: T&T Clark, 2011), p. 10.

65 For example, Paul Alexander, *Signs and Wonders: Why Pentecostalism is the World's Fastest Growing Faith* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2009).

66 Daniel E. Albrecht and Evan B. Howard, 'Pentecostal Spirituality', in *The Cambridge Companion to Pentecostalism,* ed. by Cecil M. Robeck, Jr. and Amos Yong, Cambridge Companions to Religion (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014), pp. 235–253 (p. 237).

67 Tillam, *The fourth principle of Christian religion*, p. 36.

68 Cf. Weaver, *Baptists and the Holy Spirit*, pp. 21–22.

69 For the specific example of Chinese Christianity, cf. Gotthard Oblau, 'Divine Healing and the Growth of Practical Christianity in China', in *Global Pentecostal and Charismatic Healing*, ed. by Candy Gunther Brown (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), pp. 307–327; Michael J. McClymond, 'Charismatic Renewal and Neo-Pentecostalism: From North American Origins to

early English Baptists, it was a similarly pervasive and surprisingly uncontroversial practice. They prayed for healing with a comparable trust in God's power to dramatically overcome illness, giving forthright testimony to occasions when such a grace was granted.

The early Baptist rejection of forms to rely instead upon the Spirit's inspiration resonates with Pentecostal theologies of worship. While, according to Pentecostal theologian Wolfgang Vondey, early Pentecostals did not develop their liturgical practices in explicit opposition to established forms, they nevertheless reconstituted worship to allow for greater freedom and flexibility to engage the Spirit's promptings.[70] Church historian Grant Wacker described early Pentecostal worship as 'planned spontaneity', which is to say that it was crafted so as to heighten the probability that believers would experience a transformative encounter with God.[71] In parallel with the evolution of Baptist gatherings, Pentecostal worship has formalised over time while the role of the preached sermon and the training of the preacher have increased in significance.[72]

But irrespective of shifts in the *ordo*, the essentiality of the Spirit's presence remains a central conviction of Pentecostal theology. What Albrecht declares about Pentecostal liturgics bears no distinction from what has been demonstrated regarding the early English Baptists: 'Any liturgy minus the Spirit, or minus the people's engagement in the work of worship […] is in danger of being the mere work of humans, not the work of God in and through and with humans.'[73] While the various

---

Global Permutations', in *The Cambridge Companion to Pentecostalism*, ed. by Robeck and Yong, pp. 31–51 (p. 40); Wonsuk Ma, 'Asian Pentecostalism in Context: A Challenging Portrait', in *The Cambridge Companion to Pentecostalism*, ed. by Robeck and Yong, pp. 152–173 (p. 159).

[70] Vondey, *Beyond Pentecostalism*, p. 128.

[71] Grant A. Wacker, *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals and American Culture* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2001), p. 99.

[72] Aaron Friesen, 'Classical Pentecostal Liturgy: Between Formalism and Fanaticism', in *Scripting Pentecost: A Study of Pentecostals, Worship and Liturgy. Explorations in Practical, Pastoral and Empirical Theology*, ed. by Mark J. Cartledge and A. J. Swoboda (Abingdon: Routledge, 2017), pp. 53–68 (p. 58).

[73] Daniel E. Albrecht, 'Worshiping and the Spirit: Transmuting Liturgy Pentecostally', in *The Spirit in Worship – Worship in the Spirit*, ed. by Teresa Berger and Bryan D. Spinks (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2009), pp. 223–244 (p. 223). Cf. Tombes, who wrote that no one can worship God 'unless the Spirit of God dwell and act in him' (Iehovah iireh, p. 5).

Christian communions generally affirm, in principle, the necessity of the Spirit for authentic worship in song, Scripture, and sacrament, the early Baptists and Pentecostals have foregrounded this belief through the expectation that the Spirit will 'show up' and with the confidence that specific actions in worship manifest divine inspiration. Among the first Baptists, such spiritual anointing was ascribed to prophetic singing and later the composition of congregational hymns. Pentecostals have found this anointing in spontaneous preaching and testimony, congregational singing in tongues, and other seemingly supernatural manifestations.[74]

Finally, the Baptists who insisted on the laying on of hands for reception of the gifts evoke an obvious parallel to the multifarious Pentecostal doctrines grouped under the umbrella term of 'baptism in the Holy Spirit'. Amos Yong notes that the post-conversion reception of the Spirit, accompanied by speaking in tongues, has been recognised as *the* central characteristic of Pentecostalism.[75] However, this definitive teaching has been anything but uniform, with extensive debate over its purpose, distinctiveness vis-à-vis regeneration, and its relatedness to tongues as an evidential sign. Pentecostal and charismatic disputation over baptism of the Holy Spirit offers a word of caution against facile comparisons with laying on of hands as practised by some of the first English Baptists. The latter, for their part, also failed to construct a systematic consensus regarding the significance of the rite and its place in the journey of Christian initiation. What can be said is that, for both these early Baptists and for later Pentecostals, the experience of a post-baptismal reception of the Spirit indicates a shared sense of dependence upon and seeking after divine empowerment for faithful living. In this respect, Pentecostals and the early Baptists have aimed at the same target: waiting on the Spirit so they may be gifted and shaped by the Spirit in service of the *missio Dei*.

Certain notable differences between seventeenth-century Baptists and modern Pentecostals remain, apart from the general reluctance of the former to recognise the ongoing validity of all the

---

74 Albrecht, 'Worshiping and the Spirit', pp. 231, 240; Friesen, 'Classical Pentecostal liturgy', pp. 57, 59.

75 Amos Yong, *Renewing Christian Theology: Systematics for a Global Christianity* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2014), ch. 4. Kindle edition.

biblical workings of the Spirit. There is no evidence whatsoever that Baptists exhibited that most distinctive of charismatic practices; namely, *glossolalia* or the ecstatic, non-grammatical utterances known today as speaking in tongues. Even the figures most affirming of continuity referred to tongues in the abstract and not as an immanent manifestation. When they discussed the hypothetical gift of tongues, they understood it to be *xenolalia*, or the supernatural grace to speak an unlearned foreign language. Baptist worship, while allowing for spontaneity as members prophesied and sang hymns, did not nurture enthusiastic physical exertions of the sort that would scandalise opponents of later revivalist movements, such as intense bodily motions, 'holy laughter', or the paralysis of being 'slain in the Spirit'. Ecstatic phenomena were not unknown among English dissenters of the period, especially the Quakers. It is probable that Baptists curtailed any expressions in their midst so as to maintain some respectability in the Reformed mainstream over against the radical fringes.[76]

Baptist theologian Curtis Freeman has proposed, with a wry sense of humour, that the significant traits shared between Baptists and Pentecostals — namely, conversionist spirituality, believer's baptism, and global evangelism — reveal the latter effectively to be 'Baptists with a foreign-language requirement'.[77] In the case of the early Baptists, can we justifiably reverse the comparison and consider them to be Pentecostals before Pentecostalism? If we define Pentecostal or 'Spirit-empowered' Christianity according to a taxonomy of distinctive characteristics, as Gina Zurlo and Todd Johnson do, then the first Baptists are not particularly representative, with no or minimal

[76] On Quaker charismata, including possibly the exercise of tongues, see Hyatt, *2000 Years of Charismatic Christianity*, pp. 89–93; Carole D. Spencer, 'Holiness: The Quaker Way of Perfection', *Quaker History*, 93, no. 1 (Spring 2004), 131–132. For Baptist objections to emotional displays in Quaker worship, cf. T. L. Underwood, *Primitivism, Radicalism, and the Lamb's War: The Baptist-Quaker Conflict in Seventeenth-Century England,* Oxford Studies in Historical Theology (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), p. 94. For both Baptist and Quaker impulses to achieve a greater measure of social and theological respectability, see Underwood, *Primitivism, Radicalism, and the Lamb's War*, pp. 11–12.

[77] Curtis Freeman, 'Pentecostal power', *Baptists News Global*, 25 May 2012 <https://baptistnews.com/article/pentecostal-power/> [accessed 21 June 2022].

expression of typical features.[78] But the beliefs and practices noted in this article compare favourably with qualitative descriptions of 'Pentecostalism' as a generic form of Christian spirituality. In Lesslie Newbigin's classic study of major perspectives on the nature of the Church, he categorises these into the three 'streams' of Catholic, Protestant, and Pentecostal. While the Catholic stream prioritises the structure of the church and the Protestant emphasises its proclamation, the Pentecostal stream centralises the 'experienced power and presence of the Holy Spirit today'. The church is not just where the word of God is rightly preached and the sacraments rightly administered, but also where the Spirit is acting in power.[79] More recent scholars such as Wolfgang Vondey and Allan Anderson have sharpened the definition of generic Pentecostalism as a diverse movement of believers who prize the ecstatic encounter with the Holy Spirit manifesting in spiritual gifts, signs, and wonders.[80] What distinguishes 'Spirit-empowered' or 'Pentecostal' believers from other Christians is not the (universally claimed) dependence upon the Spirit, but the *operationalising* of this conviction in regular practice. When significant numbers of early Baptists sought the Spirit's gifts through the laying on of hands, felt immediate inspiration in worship, and prayed confidently for the healing of illness, they exemplified strong pentecostal tendencies, even if not to a degree or a consistency that commands typological acceptance.

Present-day Baptists are perpetually attentive to their origins and history as these contribute to contemporary discussions of theological identity. The recognition that Baptist forebears expressed a 'Pentecostal' spirituality invites reflection on how their successors may conceive of the Spirit's activity in their midst. Such awareness also calls Baptists toward an ecumenical horizon in mutual recognition of the faith they share with Spirit-empowered believers. Although a previous attempt to initiate a formal bilateral dialogue between the Baptist World Alliance

---

[78] For their taxonomy, see chapter 1, 'History and Characteristics', in Zurlo and Johnson's forthcoming book, *Introducing Spirit-Empowered Christianity*.

[79] Lesslie Newbigin, *The Household of God* (New York: Friendship Press, 1954), pp. 94–95.

[80] See Wolfgang Vondey, *Pentecostal Theology: Living the Full Gospel*, Systematic Pentecostal and Charismatic Theology (London: Bloomsbury T&T Clark, 2017), pp. 3–6; Allan Heaton Anderson, *To the Ends of the Earth: Pentecostalism and the Transformation of World Christianity,* Oxford Studies in World Christianity (Oxford: Oxford University Press), pp. 5–8.

and the Pentecostal World Fellowship failed a decade ago,[81] a growing recognition of common bonds can, and I believe shall, motivate further convergence as Christians 'seek the unity of the Spirit in the bonds of peace' (Eph. 4:3).

[81] Curtis W. Freeman, personal email correspondence, 20 June 2022.